

# Climate Change Impacts Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary



July 2020 Photo: Greg McFall/NOAA



Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary protects a vibrant marine ecosystem home to hundreds of diverse species. Photo: NOAA

#### **Our Changing Ocean**

The impacts of <u>climate change</u> are intensifying both globally and locally, threatening America's physical, social, economic, and environmental <u>well-being</u>.<sup>1</sup> <u>National marine sanctuaries and marine national</u> <u>monuments</u> must contend with <u>rising water temperatures</u> and <u>sea levels</u>, water that is <u>more acidic</u> and <u>contains</u> <u>less oxygen</u>, <u>shifting species</u>, and <u>altered weather patterns and storms</u>.<sup>1</sup> While all of our sanctuaries and national monuments must face these global effects of climate change, each is affected differently.

#### **Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary**

<u>Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary</u>, established in 1989 and expanded in 2015, protects 1,286 square miles of ocean offshore of the north-central coast of California. <u>Cordell Bank</u> rises from the soft sediment of the continental shelf to within 115 feet of the surface, with rocky substrate providing habitat for invertebrates, algae, and fishes. Another prominent seafloor feature, <u>Bodega Canyon</u>, cuts into the continental shelf providing soft and rocky habitat for deep water corals, sponges, and fishes. Cool, nutrient-rich waters, transported from the deep, drive a dynamic food web and vibrant sanctuary ecosystem that supports abundant marine mammals, sponges and deep water corals, krill, seabirds, and economically and ecologically important fish species.

#### Changes to Upwelling

<u>Alongshore winds</u> and the rotation of the Earth cause cool, nutrient-rich deep waters to rise to the surface in a process called <u>upwelling</u>, fueling the food web of the sanctuary. While upwelled waters are rich in nutrients,

they are also lower in oxygen and are more acidic than surface waters, properties that influence the ecological community of the sanctuary.

Upwelling is a major oceanographic and ecological process in the sanctuary and is responsible for the high productivity of the ocean in this region. The productivity driven by upwelling influences many aspects of the sanctuary's ecosystem from the timing and success of seabird nesting<sup>2,3</sup> to the presence of migratory species. Species such as <u>blue</u> and <u>humpback</u> <u>whales</u> travel from Mexico and Central America to feed in the sanctuary while seabirds arrive from as far



Changes to upwelling could affect the zooplankton prey of predators like Laysan albatross and other migratory birds. *Photo: Laura Morse/NOAA* 

Case Study 1—The 2014-16 Marine Heatwave



Sea surface temperature anomaly (°C above average temperature) along the west coast on September 1, 2014 during the 2014-16 marine heatwave. *Photo: NOAA Fisheries, data from NOAA Coral Reef Watch* 

In 2013, a system of persistent, unusually high atmospheric pressure formed south of the Gulf of Alaska.<sup>17-19</sup> This high pressure system reduced the amount of heat transferred from the ocean to the atmosphere, in part by weakening wind, which eventually led to a pool of persistent warm water forming off the coast of Alaska.<sup>17,18</sup> This warm water anomaly, dubbed "The Blob," eventually spread from the Gulf of Alaska to Southern California, creating a marine heatwave along the entire Pacific coast that persisted from 2014 to 2016. This heatwave drove water temperatures over 7°F above normal in some locations;<sup>20</sup> resulted in large numbers of southern species moving north;<sup>11,21</sup> fueled a large harmful algal bloom (HAB) that killed fish, birds, and marine mammals;<sup>9</sup> delayed the opening of the Dungeness crab fishery;<sup>9,11</sup> and had impacts on prey species that altered the food web.<sup>7</sup> A similar marine heatwave formed in 2019 but mostly stayed north and west of the sanctuary and dissipated over the winter. It is too early to tell if warm water anomalies will become a recurring phenomenon, but as climate change continues, large-scale changes to oceanic and atmospheric processes may create more events like the 2014-16 warm water anomaly.

as <u>Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument</u>,<sup>4</sup> New Zealand,<sup>5</sup> and South America<sup>6</sup> to take advantage of upwelling-driven blooms of prey. Due to its importance to the ecology of the region, changes in upwelling timing or intensity have consequences for the sanctuary's ecosystem.

Warm water events like those that occur during <u>El</u> <u>Niño</u> events and marine heatwaves can reduce upwelling by creating <u>distinct layers</u> in the ocean, a process called stratification, or force it closer to shore and away from the majority of the sanctuary.<sup>7,8</sup> When this occurs, sanctuary waters receive less nutrients, leading to lower biological productivity as well as smaller and less abundant zooplankton.<sup>9,10</sup> Such changes can lead to cascading effects on species throughout the food web, affecting fish, seabirds, and marine mammals.<sup>2,9-12</sup> Low-upwelling events could become more common in the future as the frequency and intensity of both marine heatwaves and El Niño events are expected to increase.<sup>13,14</sup>

Despite periodic decreases in upwelling due to El Niño and other warm water events, increases in alongshore winds in recent decades have resulted in a rise in upwelling duration and intensity,<sup>15</sup> which is projected to continue in the coming century.<sup>16</sup> While an increase in upwelling may enhance biological productivity in the sanctuary, it could also lead to decreases in oxygen, increases in acidity, and a slowing of ocean warming. These changes, which are discussed in depth later in this report, could have impacts on sanctuary resources.



Elephant seals and other marine mammals that feed in the sanctuary depend on upwelling-driven productivity. *Photo: Peter Pyle/NOAA* 

#### Case Study 2—Zooplankton and Climate Change



Zooplankton are a critical part of the food web in the sanctuary and may be impacted by climate change *Photo: Russ Hopcroft/UAF* 

Zooplankton, small, sometimes microscopic animals, are a critical part of the sanctuary ecosystem and food web. The zooplankton community in the sanctuary is typically dominated by copepods and krill<sup>22</sup> that feed on the <u>phytoplankton</u>, microscopic algae that thrive on the high nutrient waters provided by upwelling. The zooplankton of the sanctuary are nutritious prey that are high in fats. Fish, seabirds, and mammals feed on zooplankton or forage fish like anchovy, which themselves prey on zooplankton, making these tiny animals critical links in the food web.

Climate change and ocean acidification may have adverse impacts on many zooplankton species in the sanctuary. Krill have reduced reproductive success under acidic conditions<sup>23</sup> and the shells of <u>pteropods</u>,

small sea snails that are important prey for fish such as salmon, thin under acidic conditions.<sup>24,25</sup> Zooplankton are also affected by warmer waters. During past El Niño events and heatwaves in the California Current, the zooplankton community shifted to smaller, less nutritious southern species,<sup>9,10,22,26</sup> the krill population declined,<sup>7</sup> and the overall biomass of zooplankton fell as much as 90%.<sup>27</sup> During the 2014-2016 warm water anomaly, these changes disrupted the food web and were partly responsible for mass mortalities of seabirds<sup>2,9</sup> and marine mammals<sup>11,12</sup> throughout the California Current ecosystem. Further, during the heatwave, reductions in krill in offshore areas such as the sanctuary forced humpback whales to feed on fish that were closer to shore, resulting in record numbers of whale entanglements in fishing gear across the West Coast in 2015 and 2016.<sup>7</sup>

While there is no danger of zooplankton disappearing entirely from the waters of the sanctuary, climate change will likely continue to alter the zooplankton community in ways that will have consequences for the number and types of species that the ecosystem can support.



Krill are a zooplankton of particular importance as prey to whales, seabirds, and other marine mammals and fish. Photo: Shannon Lyday/NOAA

### Deoxygenation and Hypoxia

As waters warm, the ability of the ocean to hold oxygen decreases.<sup>28</sup> Warming waters also cause the ocean to form distinct layers, reducing mixing and limiting the exchange of oxygen and nutrients.<sup>28</sup> The global ocean has already experiences a 2% decline in oxygen since 1960 and is predicted to decline up to another 3-4% by 2100.<sup>29</sup>

Low oxygen conditions, called hypoxia, have become increasingly common in the ocean off California in recent years.<sup>28,30</sup> Ocean oxygen concentrations off California have fallen 20% since 1980<sup>31,32</sup> and may fall below the range of natural variability by 2030.33 The deepest parts of the sanctuary are naturally low in oxygen, but shallow areas are also experiencing low oxygen events for short periods in some years.<sup>30</sup> Upwelling brings low oxygen water to the surface and plankton blooms fueled by upwelled nutrients can further reduce oxygen levels when they use oxygen at night or decay.<sup>34</sup> Decreased ocean oxygen globally, and changes to the supply of oxygen to deep waters as a result of climate change, are producing upwelled water that is even lower in oxygen than in the past with direct impacts on oxygen concentrations in the sanctuary.<sup>35,36</sup>

Direct effects from hypoxia to organisms in the deep sea are less well understood but could increase stress and shrink available habitat.<sup>37</sup> Economically important species like Dungeness crab and rockfish have been shown to move away from hypoxic areas and future conditions could reduce the available habitat for these species.<sup>31,38-42</sup> Decreased oxygen could also lead to an increase in species that can thrive in these conditions such as Humboldt squid, which prey on economically important species.<sup>43</sup> As hypoxic conditions become more widespread in the coming century,<sup>34</sup> effects such as these are likely to become more common in the sanctuary.



Many deep water and bottom-dwelling species in the sanctuary could be affected by lower oxygen levels. Species IDs (top to bottom): crinoids, China rockfish, swiftia coral and brittle stars. *Photos: Michael Carver/NOAA; NOAA/MARE; NOAA* 



Pink hydrocoral and other species with stony skeletons and shells are likely to be impacted by ocean acidification. Photo: NOAA

# Ocean Acidification

On average, the global ocean has become 30% more acidic since the beginning of the industrial revolution.<sup>44,45</sup> Due in part to upwelling, the acidity of U.S. West Coast waters has risen faster than other regions, up to 60% since 1895, and will continue to rise.<sup>46,47</sup> The sanctuary is located in an area of persistent high acidity.<sup>28</sup>

Increasingly acidic waters make it difficult for shell -forming animals like Dungeness crab and deep water coral to make and maintain shells and stony skeletons.<sup>34</sup> Deep water corals are particularly susceptible as deep waters are naturally more acidic than the surface and some areas are already acidic

enough slow their growth.<sup>48</sup> Further, acidification could reduce larval survival in Dungeness crab<sup>49</sup> and krill<sup>23</sup> while also increasing stress and decreasing larval survival in rockfish and other species without shells.<sup>39,40,50,51</sup>

Fish, birds, mammals, and coral can also be indirectly affected by acidification through adverse impacts on their prey.<sup>23,24,52</sup> More acidic waters could adversely affect zooplankton, a critical link in the food web, potentially reducing their numbers. Pteropods, important prey for fish, are particularly susceptible to increasingly acidic waters,<sup>24</sup> and krill, prey for salmon, seabirds, and whales, may experience reduced larval survival as acidity increases.<sup>23</sup> Due to these effects, Dungeness crabs may be more negatively affected by reductions of prey driven by acidification than its direct impacts.<sup>52</sup> The effects of ocean acidification on prey species could have consequences for the entire food web from corals to blue whales.<sup>21-23</sup>

# Rising Water Temperatures and Multiple Stressors

As global temperatures rise, the average ocean temperature is increasing world wide.<sup>1</sup> Water temperatures in the region of the sanctuary have risen slightly over the past century<sup>53</sup> and could warm 7°F by 2100.54

Warming waters hold less oxygen, contributing to hypoxia, and could lead to more frequent and intense harmful algal blooms (HABs).55,56 HABs produce toxins that can harm whales, birds, and other animals.<sup>57,58</sup> waters warm. *Photo: Kevin L Stierhoff/NOAA* 



wildlife, causing mass mortalities of Humboldt squid and other southern species could become more common in the sanctuary as

Warming waters may also allow species to move northward or force them deeper to cooler waters.<sup>59</sup> As a result, southern species could become more common in the sanctuary while others may decline in number.<sup>28,42,60</sup>

The stressors highlighted in this report are affecting the sanctuary simultaneously. The ways in which these multiple stressors interact to affect wildlife and other resources are often complex and difficult to predict. For example, while recruitment of some rockfish species may increase during warm years,<sup>9</sup> they could be negatively affected by lower oxygen and higher acidity.<sup>40,41</sup> Understanding how individual factors are expected to change, interact, and affect sanctuary resources provides the basic information needed to begin to understand and address the multiple interacting stressors of climate change.

# Some Ways the Sanctuary Staff Is Responding to Climate Change

NOAA is working to understand how the sanctuary is affected by climate change in order to better manage for ecological resilience. NOAA scientists and sanctuary staff have identified potential climate impacts and <u>climate</u> <u>indicators</u> and are <u>monitoring</u> a suite of indicators through partnerships with non-profits and universities in long term projects. These include the sanctuary's <u>benthic science program</u>, Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies ecosystem monitoring, and <u>hypoxia monitoring</u>.

The sanctuary staff is evaluating and working to reduce its greenhouse gas emissions and is collaborating with others to address emissions in the sanctuary. For example, a project encouraging shipping companies to <u>voluntarily slow ship speeds</u> to reduce whale strikes resulted in reduced air emissions. Managers and partners also work to reduce non-climate stressors, like disturbance to sensitive seafloor habitats, to maintain a healthy ecosystem that may be more resilient to climate change.

Climate change information is included in many sanctuary <u>outreach and education initiatives</u> and at sanctuary advisory council meetings. As an example, NOAA developed an ocean acidification curriculum, including a communication toolkit featuring a <u>Dungeness crab case study</u>, to help teachers, advisory council members, and others communicate the causes and consequences of ocean acidification.



Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary protects a unique, vibrant, and thriving ecosystem. Photo: Jess Morten/NOAA



#### Citations

- 1. USGCRP (2018) Impacts, Risks, and Adaptation in the United States: Fourth National Climate Assessment, Volume II. U.S. Global Change Research Program
- 2. Piatt et al. (2020) Extreme mortality and reproductive failure of common murres resulting from the northeast Pacific marine heatwave of 2014-2016. PLoS One
- 3. Jahncke et al. (2008) Ecosystem responses to short-term climate variability in the Gulf of the Farallones, California, Prog. Oceanogr.
- 4. Hyrenbach et al. (2005) Use of marine sanctuaries by far anging predators: commuting flights to the California Current System by breeding Hawaiian albatrosses. Fish. Oceangr.
- 5. Shaffer et al. (2006) Migratory shearwaters integrate oceanic resources across the Pacific Ocean in an endless summer. Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. US
- 6. Felis et al. (2019) Eastern Pacific migration strategies of pink-footed shearwaters Ardenna creatopus: Implications for fisheries interactions and international conservation. Endanger. Species Res.
- 7.Santora et al. (2020) Habitat compression and ecosystem shifts as potential links between marine heatwave and record whale entanglements. PLoS One
- 8. Jacox et al. (2016) Impacts of the 2015–2016 El Niño on the California Current System: Early assessment and comparison to past events. Geophys. Res. Lett.
- 9. Cavole et al. (2016) Biological impacts of the 2013-2016 warm-water anomaly in the northeast Pacific: Winners, losers, and the future. Oceanography
- 10. McGowan et al. (1998) Climate-ocean variability and ecosystem response in the North Pacific. Science
- 11. Sanford et al. (2019) Widespread shifts in the coastal biota of northern California during the 2014–2016 marine heatwaves. Sci Rep.
- 12. DiLorenzo and Mantua (2016) Multi-year persistence of the 2014/15 north Pacific marine heatwave. Nature Climate Change.
- 13. Frölicher et al. (2018) Marine heatwaves under global warming. Nature
- 14. Cai et al. (2014) Increasing frequency of extreme El Niño events due to greenhouse warming. Nature Climate Change
- 15. Garcia-Reyes and Largier (2010) Observations of increased wind driven coastal upwelling off central California. J./Geophys. Res. Oceans
- 16. Xiu et al. (2018) Future changes in coastal upwelling ecosystems with global warming: The case of the California Current System. Sci. Rep.
- 17. Bond et al. (2015) Causes and impacts of the 2014 warm anomaly in the NE Pacific. Geophys. Res. Lett.
- 18. Herring et al. (2018) Explaining extreme events of 2016 form a climate perspective. Bull. Am. Meterol. Soc.
- 19. Anderson et al. (2016) A decadal precession of atmospheric pressures over the North Pacific. Geophys. Res. Lett.
- 20. Gentemann et al. (2016) Satellite sea surface temperatures along the West Coast of the United States during the 2014–2016 northeast Pacific marine heat wave. Geophys. Res. Lett.
- 21. Lonhart et al. (2019) Shifts in the distribution and abundance of coastal marine species along the eastern Pacific Ocean during marine heatwaves from 2013 to 2018. Mar. Biodivers. Rec.
- 22. Fisher et al. (2015) The impact of El Niño events on the pelagic food chain in the northern California Current. Glob. Change Biol.
- 23. McLaskey et al. (2016) Development of Euphausia pacifica (krill) larvae is impaired under pCO2 levels currently observed in the Northeast Pacific. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.
- 24. Bednaršek et al. (2017) Exposure history determines pteropod vulnerability to ocean acidification along the US West Coast. Sci. Rep.
- 25. Bednaršek et al. (2014) Limacina helicina shell dissolution as an indicator of declining habitat suitability owing to ocean acidification in the California Current Ecosystem. Proc. Roy. Soc. B.
- 26. Elliot and Jahncke (2019) Ocean Climate Indicators Status Report: 2018. Point Blue Conservation Science, Petaluma, California.
- 27.Roemmich and McGowan (1995) Climatic warming and the decline of zooplankton in the California Current. Science
- 28. Chan et al. (2017) Persistent spatial structuring of coastal ocean acidification in the California Current System. Sci. Rep.
- 29. Stramma and Schmidtko (2019) Global evidence of ocean deoxygenation. In: IUCN: Ocean deoxygenation: Everyone's problem
- 30. Keller et al. (2015) Occurrence of demersal fishes in relation to near-bottom oxygen levels within the California Current large marine ecosystem. Fish. Ocranogr.
- 31. Bograd et al. (2015) Changes in source waters to the Southern California Bight. Deep Sea Res. II
- 32. Ito et al. (2017) Upper ocean O2 trends: 1958-2015. Geophys. Res. Lett.
- 33. Long et al. (2016) Finding forced trends in oceanic oxygen. Glob. Biogeochem. Cyc.
- 34. Keeling et al. (2010) Ocean deoxygenation in a warming world. Annu. Rev. Mar. Sci.
- 35. Bernatis et al. (2007) Behavioural responses of the Dungeness crab, Cancer magister, during feeding and digestion in hypoxic conditions. Mar. Biol.
- 36. Chan et al. (2008) Emergence of anoxia in the California Current Large Marine Ecosystem. Science
- 37. Brito-Morales et al. (2020) Climate velocity reveals increasing exposure of deep-ocean biodiversity to future warming. Nat. Clim. Change
- 38. Froehlich et al. (2014) Movement Patterns and Distributional Shifts of Dungeness Crab (*Metacarcinus magister*) and English Sole (*Parophrys vetulus*) During Seasonal Hypoxia. *Estuar. Coast.*
- 39. Keller et al. (2010) Demersal fish and invertebrate biomass in relation to an offshore hypoxic zone along the US West Coast. Fisher. Oceanogr.
- 40. McClatchie et al. (2010) Oxygen in the Southern California Bight: Multidecadal trends and implications for demersal fisheries. *Geophys. Res. Lett.*
- 41. Hamilton et al. (2017) Species-specific responses of juvenile rockfish to elevated pCO2: From behavior to genomics. PLoS One
- 42. Koslow et al. (2011) Impact of declining intermediate-water oxygen on deepwater fishes in the California Current. Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.
- 43. Ramos et al. (2017) Characterization of the northernmost spawning habitat of Dosidicus gigas with implications on its northwards range extension . Mar. Ecol. Prog. Ser.
- 44. Haugan & Drange (1996) Effects of CO2 on the ocean environment. *Energy Conv. Manag.*
- 45. Doney et al. (2009) Ocean acidification: The other CO2 problem? Annu. Rev. Mar. Sci.
- 46. Gruber et al. (2012) Rapid progression of ocean acidification in the California Current System. Science
- 47. Osborne et al. (2020) Decadal variability in twentieth-century ocean acidification in the California Current Ecosystem. Nature Geosci.
- 48. Gómez et al. (2018) Growth and feeding of deep-sea coral Lophelia pertusa from the California margin under simulated ocean acidification conditions. PeerJ
- 49. Bednaršek et al. (2020) Exoskeleton dissolution with mechanoreceptor damage in larval Dungeness crab related to severity of present-day ocean acidification vertical gradients. Sci. Tot. Enviro.
- 50. Munday et al. (2010) Replenishment of fish populations is threatened by ocean acidification. Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. US
- 51. Rossi et al. (2016) Lost at sea: ocean acidification undermines larval fish orientation via altered hearing and marine soundscape modification. Biol. Lett.
- 52. Hodgson et al. (2018) Consequences of spatially variable ocean acidification in the California Current: Lower pH drives strongest declines in benthic species in southern regions while greatest economic impacts occur in northern regions. *Ecol. Model.*
- 53. Johnstone and Mantua (2014) Atmospheric controls on northeast Pacific temperature variability and change, 1900–2012. Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. US
- 54. Alexander et al. (2018) Projected sea surface temperatures over the 21st century: Changes in the mean, variability and extremes for large marine ecosystem regions of Northern Oceans. *Elem. Sci. Anthrop.*
- 55. Gobler et al. (2017) Ocean warming since 1982 has expanded the niche of toxic algal blooms in the North Atlantic and North Pacific oceans. *Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. US* 56. McKibben et al. (2017) Climatic regulation of the neurotoxin domoic acid. *Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. US*
- 57. McCabe et al. (2016) An unprecedented coastwide toxic algal bloom linked to anomalous ocean conditions. Geophys. Res. Lett.
- 58. Alther et al. (2010) Forecasting the consequences of climate-driven shifts in human behavior on cetaceans. Mar. Pol.
- 59. Poloczanska et al. (2013) Global imprint of climate change on marine life. Nature
- 60. Hobday et al. (2016) A hierarchical approach to defining marine heatwaves. Prog. Oceangr.